Beyond The Frame Symposium - Part 2

[00:00:05] Welcome to The Seattle Public Library's podcasts of author readings and library events. Library podcasts are brought to you by The Seattle Public Library and Foundation. To learn more about our programs and podcasts, visit our web site at w w w dot SPL dot org. To learn how you can help the library foundation support The Seattle Public Library go to foundation dot SPL dot org

[00:00:36] This podcast is being presented in two parts. You are listening to part 2.

[00:00:42] Now when I say non-native photographers what many people might show would be this non native white male photographers because after all those are the ones that are represented most in books and in museums. But this is the year women including actually the first two native women were elected to the U.S. Congress.

[00:01:08] So to celebrate that and to celebrate the year women I'm now going to give to non-native white male photographers the same amount of time that's usually given to native and female photographers. Moving right along

[00:01:41] I do want to spend some time since it easier women talking about some of the lesser known women photographers who were also active around Curtis's time. This woman and we are all free men. I think it's fascinating. She had her own studio in Northern California where she photographed among the euro and the hoop up people and she had this similarity of the pictorial style. She took photos not necessarily in her studio but she used a soft focus. She used dramatic lighting. She was really capturing I think that wonderful expression in Native communities around her this woman Julia tool is fascinating. She lived in and South Dakota and Montana. And if you think he looks young in this picture she was she was 19 when this was taken and she was 16 when she married forty three year old Peavy tool and moved to the northern China reservation in Montana. But while she was there because she was young and sort of unassuming she was able to capture these wonderful scenes of native dancers and native people in the community without any pretense. So you'll find in her many of her photographs nothing was ever posed. But there was a sense of the real activities that went on perhaps when there were no white people visiting their village Kate Cary is one of the more famous photographers and she lived among the Hopi people in Arizona one of the few photographers who is trained as an artist in New York City and moved by herself to Arizona. Lived among the Hopi there and took a great deal of photographs some hundreds of photographs. But she

rarely took them for the purpose of photography. She took these primarily to uses illustrations because she wrote a great deal about the Hopi and she was more known as a painter.

[00:03:54] She used some of the photographs as sketches for her painting. He also took this picture which I included because I really like it. There's of course a great deal of discussion about Curtis perhaps coercing people to be photographed maybe forcing them when they didn't want to be photographed. And I think this picture that she took really illustrates what it looks like when somebody doesn't want to be photographed. I mean look at that face. So compare that to some of Curtis's portraits. You know it's possible that some people didn't feel comfortable in his photographs but they certainly wanted to be photographed. And as Clay showed the amount of work it takes to setup the camera to pose people to get the lighting right took a lot of time. So Curtis we know was paid paid many of the people for the photographs but also many of them came willingly because they wanted a record of themselves and not being forced to be photographed as this woman was generated. Brooks was known more as a collector. She collected a lot of blankets baskets and other items. But when she was collecting she would take these wonderful snapshots of some of the artists who made the objects that she collected. And I just love this portrait it's almost as fresh as today. This young girl in this doorway at one of the studios where she was collecting artwork then there's this woman Mary Schaefer who is trained as a botanist. She worked in the Canadian Rockies and primarily went around collecting examples of wildflowers. She went to the native people there than Lakota to ask them for their knowledge about wildflowers.

[00:05:47] And they took her around.

[00:05:48] And part of what she gained from this one of them was this familiarity. And she took some these wonderful sort of posed pictures but yet with an informality of many of the Dakota people and creating several pictures of this man Simpson Beaver and his if you look her up you'll see mostly the illustrations. She was a beautiful illustrator of these wildflowers as well and there are several books about her. This woman E. Jane gay bit controversial. She photographed mainly as part of an expedition led by a woman named Alice Fletcher and she took a lot of photographs that had been criticized a bit for showing perhaps a little bit too positive of a view of the government's land acquisition program but at the same time Jane gay is recognized by many people as the first American lesbian photographer so she has this mixed legacy of a woman on her own trying to make a living and yet perhaps was influenced a bit too much by this Alice Fletcher who led the expedition to study some of the native people she was photographed. And Matilda Cox Stevenson was a technologist she wrote extensively about the Zuni the TR and the Zia peoples in New Mexico.

[00:07:16] But she only took a few photos. But one of them is really important. This one of Weiwei was a Zuni Mina or two spirit person one of the few photos that was taken early on or two spirit people at that time and she captured I think this wonderful stature of this person Wei war who was loved by the community there. They had no problems and by to spirit they mean people who were considered to be of both sexes or perhaps neither sex but this picture captures this wonderful person at a time when certainly the Anglo community would not have even thought about taking pictures like this. And finally there is this woman Benedick Grinstead who is a Danish American woman

photographed among the Northern Shoshone and bannock people in Idaho. There's a great collection of her works. Idaho and Boise. And she's known for these portraits that I think use the pictorial as lighting style but they capture also sort of a naturalism to them.

[00:08:29] So she's somebody that again has been ignored but certainly was in the same vein as courteous as he took many of his pictures so I'm not going to circle back around DeCurtis and sort of echo some of the comments that Clay made earlier. Because this is one of Curtis's most famous portraits and it's a portrait that I think is a hallmark of many of his images because of what Clay pointed out earlier. Those eyes was penetrating eyes that he used and was able to essentially convince her somehow to give him that stare. And it was certainly successful in convincing JP Morgan to get funding. And I thought it was interesting if you compare that photo with this one you get the same sort of technique being used today to perhaps get people to buy magazines or to look at a story or to become involved. I found it interesting that this particular young man was being used to tell a story about the last tribes of the Amazon which has kind of a similar tone to the vanishing race and yet here it is more than a hundred years later that we're seeing similarities between Curtis's work and contemporary work. Curtis's gift one of his gifts certainly is this ability to capture the spirit of people and he wasn't the only one who did that. Some of these other photographers and certainly some of the women photographers were lesser known also had this amazing gift. But Curtis could do it more than anyone else out there. I think part of what we should be doing today as we engage in conversations is to think about how Curtis learned from Alfred Stieglitz. You learn from Worsley Hinton but he also had to learn from this man J.P. Morgan as it was Morgan who told him make me the most beautiful set of books you have ever seen. I think certainly Curtis did that with 20 volumes of the North American Indian I've been praised by many many people but the photographs and Curtis's style portraits portrayal of the people is timeless.

[00:11:06] And yet it's timeless in a way that goes in the frame and yet beyond the frame.

[00:11:14] What I my hope for the rest of us today is we have these conversations as we take this frame and we not only remove it but we just make it part of the images of all the photographers were working during Curtis's time. No one stands alone certainly not Edward Curtis although he stands out. He didn't stand alone and I hope our conversations today will include many of the other photographers many of the First Nations the native and indigenous people who were photographed and how we begin to think about them in our own

[00:12:01] I think we'll get started with the next session. I'm Jody Fenton I manage special collections here in the Seattle Public Library and I'm very happy to be part of the Beyond the Frame initiative for the whole year. And this is Native American Heritage Month and we're happy to have symposium during that time. Our next speaker is Elizabeth Brown and full confession she's been a good friend of mine for a while. So everything I say here is is true.

[00:12:33] Elizabeth is an independent scholar consultant and educator specializing in the history of photography and contemporary art from 2000 to 2011. She was chief curator of exhibitions at collections at the Henry art gallery in Seattle following similar positions at the Allen Memorial Art

Library Art Museum in Oberlin College and the University Art Museum at UC Santa Barbara. She's published numerous articles essays exhibition catalogues and curated over 50 major exhibitions including mid career surveys of Kiki Smith Larry put up drawings all exploring how contemporary art affects the viewer. One hundred and fifty works of art an innovative display of the Henrys permanent collection round earned her MBA from the University of Michigan and further degrees all in art history from Columbia University in New York. Here in Seattle she has taught at the photographic center Northwest University of Washington Seattle University Gage Academy Cornish College of the Arts. Her teaching and scholarship focus on the transformative power of expiring works of art as they were meant to be seen and how artists think and communicate visually. Please welcome Elizabeth.

[00:14:01] Well first of all I want to thank clay and Tim for setting me up perfectly. I am not a Curtis specialist. I'm an artist story. And so I thought it would be actually useful for the purposes of the group the purposes of the day to situate Curtis in his art historical context which does start indeed with pictorial ism. This extraordinary photographic movement that that emphasized emotion that emphasized artistry and a kind of emotional connection with the the experience of the work of art as well as the subjects it contains. And here are two examples from the North American Indian of photographs that are classically pictorial list the one on the left a landscape that's practically abstract the one on the right a portrait that is both manipulated photographically and selectively lit to create more of a kind of mood than information about the subject although at the same time as both Tim and Clay emphasized ethnography and anthropological detailing was extremely important to Curtis. And there's information contained in virtually all of these images as well Curtis. Starts the North American Indian before he starts the project before he knows what he's going to do. And this photograph that he made really before he got started on any of his research endeavors typifies the kind of expression that characterizes the North American Indian. This kind of transitional time of day very beautiful landscape that's all about mood and a certain type of composition with the silhouetted boat in a big expanse of water. This is a kind of image that Curtis makes over and over again and I'll show you a few more examples from different parts of the North American Indian but it also is if anything a trope form that you see over and over again in pictorial ism that originates with the originator of pictorial ism.

[00:16:32] Peter Henry Emmerson who started a couple series of photographs in England that established this vocabulary so pictorial ism is as Tim pointed out really dominant from the eighteen nineties to the 1920s but it's actually a form of art that lasts practically a century and was very prominent in Europe at the end of the 19th century became much more powerful in America and the beginning of the 20th century but really extends all the way toward World War 2 and encompasses what professional artists are doing but also opens up a possibility for non-professional is for amateurs not and I should say that amateur is a charged word at this period. I'm not too represented somebody both in the 19th century and the early 20th century who did something because they loved it because they were devoted personally to the subject and were not contaminated by financial considerations. And then with the rise of easy means of making photographs anybody could make a picture and then amateur pictures come into the mix. So a lot of vocabulary that I'll use probably gets very problematic. It sounds to me like I'm screaming Is it too loud for you. OK good. All right. So this is one of the

classic images from Emmerson series Life and landscape on the Norfolk Broads. And as you can see it's that same format of a centralised boater in a glassy body of water that practically a race's context.

[00:18:26] There's no foreground that establishes where you are in the middle of it. So it creates this kind of dreamy experience particularly gorgeous photograph that really inspired lots of artists to feel like this was a medium for them. Here's another one of Emerson's boating pictures from the life and the Norfolk Broads series and a Kurtis one of his Klamath pictures using a very similar composition. And then two more one on the left from 1910 on the right from 1923 showing that this is a mode kind of compositional device that Curtis returned to over and over again. So this is one place where Curtis is establishing himself within the classic framework of pictorial ism another pictorial ism. Obviously it's about pictures and picture making. And until really until the end of the 20th century when people talked about art they automatically assumed that they were talking about painting so that this discourse about whether photography is a science a purely technical procedure or an art always brings in pictures and picture making as the basic means of comparison. So one of the devices pictorial lists photographers developed was manipulating photographs to make them look like paintings and on the right you see the classic example of that Edward stake in self-portrait in gum by cremate where he's manipulated the negative and then the printing technique to such an extent that really it's almost impossible to believe that you're looking at a photograph and on the left. Curtis one of the North American Indian plates that takes that device to some to a fairly exaggerated point he doesn't do that very often but this one is a good example and I think that this one's on display now in Jodi's little show. I thought it was OK sorry.

[00:20:43] There's one very similar to this and then another great example of that kind of manipulation is Vash gone. We've been looking at graveyards plates from the North American Indian. This is an OR A. One of the prints that Curtis developed and if not patented made one of his identity. So all stones are photographic prints on glass that are then treated and and toned with a metallic oil. It's called banana oil but it's actually a series of metals including some gold that gives it this golden glow to it. And these are the kind of prints that you can't see in reproduction the way that they look when you see them in person. It's just utterly different from this experience if you got to see the beautiful show at Sam last summer you experience quite a few returns and then this like the the image the Tim started with is framed in one of those elaborate frames that Curtis himself selected and really love to use for his prints.

[00:21:56] So making these was one way of expanding his audience it's also a way of bringing in money to to fund the enormously expensive North American Indian campaign this figured dissolving into the shadows or enveloped by them is another trope another device that we see the pictorial lists using frequently and brought in of print by Edward strike end of portrait of the artist George Watts that was published in camerawork and I'll talk about camera work in a moment but what it one of the places where one of the publications that would have been available in Seattle and one of the places where I would imagine Curtis learned about what other photographers were doing at the time so pictorial ism does emphasize a lot of this kind of manipulation a lot of this timelessness a lot of playing with focus and in fact one of the points where Ms. EMMERSON started was this idea of differential focus or selective focus and Emerson when he started believed that that's how the human

eye saw that you saw something in focus and then the area around it would be slightly out of focus. So that was his justification for the soft focus that ends up being such a primary characteristic of photography around the turn of the 20th century. He then learns that that wasn't the case that that wasn't how the human eye functioned and it actually discouraged the end of his career tremendously.

[00:23:43] But another aspect of pictorial ism that we forget to bring into the mix is its interest in modernist ideas in some sense sometimes minimalist compositions or an emphasis on geometry. And you see that in some early Alfred Stieglitz. And it has seemed to me for years that that's going on in this particular Curtis that shocking division of the composition with such a sharp horizontal line makes me think of modernist compositions. I also find that in this one of the architectural photographs that are so beautiful throughout the series and I love the clay showed that checklist of all the different kinds of research that you had to do in every site one of the things that is hard to remember because the portraits are so compelling is that there's images of architecture in virtually every tribe that Curtis looks at. And sometimes sometimes they're very classic images but sometimes they're kind of startling images like this one. And I liked comparing the to the photograph on the left which is a gelatin silver print part of what Curtis deposited at the Library of Congress to register his copyright so reflecting something of the original negative versus the bravura and you see how there are very subtle modifications but but anchoring those two posts in the top corners really changes your experience of the composition. Now I set up for myself to look at Curtis over the extensive period of the North American Indian project from around the turn of the century to around 1930 thinking about all of the different paradigm shifts that happen at that over and over again over that period.

[00:25:46] And Tim did a beautiful job of laying out what happens at the turn of the century. Just think about Einsteins invention of relativity. The all of the artistic inventions of the period the development of cubism around 1910 to 1912 and then World War 1 and the destruction of a belief in a stable world and then the incredible disruptions that happened in the period between World War One and World War Two. I expected to see more artistic experimentation when I looked closely at a chronological view of Curtis than I actually found. But there are a few experimental pieces and these two photographs strike me as particularly strange and compelling. They're both at the Getty and they who knows where they came from the provenance is not it's not listed but I think they were probably made while he was working on the film on the in the land of the head hunters and I particularly love the octopus picture on the left it's just it's so not what we expect Curtis to look like. I did want to point out that one of the things that I did in my methodology was try to look at Curtis chronologically which is much harder than it seems.

[00:27:09] Most of the things are not dated the sequence of photographing and publishing is completely tangled so that you'll have photographs made at the beginning of the century in some of the latest volumes of the North American Indian. But I was able to to track down some of the dates and put things together. To the extent of seeing that no Curtis actually never responded to cubism though the pieces that looked like they were taking in a cubist kind of composition were actually before he could have seen anything Cubas. So part of that you have to remind yourself that doing a research project you ask questions and sometimes the answer is no. And that is a valuable answer although not a popular one. So back to a few of these pictorial list devices. One is this kind of turning

a figure into a monolith and that also has a kind of minimalist quality to it. It's a device that Curtis liked and used over and over again. It's also something that Edward style can used to great profit. And this is not the earliest example but the images that he made of rodents Balzac which is also a fascinating artist horrible story that has nothing to do with today but anyway creates probably the or represents the closest comparison that I've been able to find to that experience.

[00:28:44] The pure emotional experience of Curtis's pictures so on the left Curtis of course a reviewer on the right Steak and doing a gun by Crowe made a very manipulated photograph of this monolithic sculpture scene in the middle of the night. And here's Curtis's review compared to the the silver gelatin prints at the Library of Congress again. And so you can see that there there's quite a bit of manipulation he's changed the qualities of the background and altered the detailing that you can see a couple other pictorial list examples. Classic pictorial list examples of similar compositions Annie Bregman on the left a famous California pictorial list and Clarence White the founder of one of the main photo schools on the East Coast. Another one of style skins series and another one of is using this figure. The only the only interruption in the horizon is this statuesque figure one of the things I did is looked for working proofs as much as I possibly could and partly because cyan types which is the medium the technology that Curtis used to prove his negatives in the field. It's such a beautiful medium. It's also a medium that has such a connection to the turn of the 20th century and one that a lot of pictorial is used to very creative ends. So here we have three different versions of the same negative. The proof made in the field the gelatin silver print on deposit at the Library of Congress and the graveyard is printed here.

[00:30:37] There isn't that much change that's happening. He's printing pretty much the entire negative which is not always the case. He hasn't altered the lighting all that much but he does seem to have intensified the internal detailing in the figure probably in the your plate and probably by hand. One of the things I've been struck by this year is how deeply upsetting some of Curtis's artistic decisions have been to native peoples. Looking at the work 100 years later and the vanishing race is the key example. The title of the image manipulation every single thing about it suggests interpretations that people who are connected to those subjects in a direct rather than artistic way rather than purely aesthetic way find deeply upsetting and out of the darkness is probably another photograph that fits into that category. But that same device out of the darkness and the vanishing race both constructed as similar compositions that structure that heavy background the use of the diagonal to suggest a passage of time.

[00:31:56] That too is something that a lot of pictorial is used over and over and over again. So I just wanted to put that in a visual context and show you how similar that composition is to Stieglitz. That was also published in camerawork one of the ways of understanding Curtis's subject outside of the specifics of an ethnographic investigation of native peoples is a fascination with the Arcadian past with a fantasy of a golden age a timeless a historical past when everything was wonderful and this is a device of fantasy that has existed throughout much of the history. I've certainly studied and was a particular was a subject that was particularly popular around the turn of the century. So this is going to be something of a visual jump but I wanted to remind you of my tease.

[00:33:01] Looking at Golden Age imagery precisely at the moment when the first volumes of the North American Indian come out on the left looks column A vous a day or luxury common voluptuous and de Bono de v flow the happiness of life on the right and there are countless examples from the end of the nineteenth century. So these two this would have been part of Curtis thinking about the audience for his photographs and the potential viewership for these volumes that native peoples would represent.

[00:33:37] The closest thing one would have to an Arcadian past another context that I think is important to remember is the idea of a intellectually informed extensive investigative series that construct constructed photographically and it starts with Peter Henry Emmerson.

[00:34:05] Actually it starts a little bit. Well it's exactly the same date. OK. So roughly the same date Emmerson looking at another Arcadian past the Norfolk Broads or other areas in England where he's looking at an ancient way of life. That's primarily agrarian. So it brings up another Arcadian ideal. The rural pastoral life Emmerson doing this extensive photographic series looking at the people as well as the landscape as well as the Customs and producing it as a luxury photographic condition. And here's another very famous example also published Emerson's first volumes published in 1888 Moy bridge published in 88 1887. So exactly the same time Moy bridge being much more overtly scientific in his investigation of how Motian looks or that's at least how it's presented representing men women children people of who are differently abled occasionally people of very different body types. One of his models was a famously obese woman.

[00:35:24] Looking at different viewing angles and trying to dissect motion over its taking over the short period of time that it's taking place and trying again to be as encyclopedic as complete as possible.

[00:35:44] And one thing you'll notice or buy pickup is that just as in Curtis and in many of the pictorial lists there's a great interest in seeing people without clothes on. And sometimes you can justify it scientifically and sometimes you can't. Couple more examples Carl Blass felt who starts making these beautiful photographs of botanical details around 1898 for teaching purposes and then publishes them in 1820 1920. Excuse me. As art forms in nature and more relevant to our purposes.

[00:36:18] August Sander who at the very beginning of the twentieth century starts making a very comprehensive portrait of the German people intended to be the people of our time I think citizens of the twentieth century which he was never allowed to to produce his his first book the face of our time in nineteen twenty nine was seized by the Nazis all of the plates were destroyed.

[00:36:45] He was forced to flee basically. But this notion and this idea of a comprehensive study that looks at all aspects of a society is absolutely unprecedented on equaled in Curtis's stature but nonetheless

[00:37:09] Something that's very much of an element of its time.

[00:37:12] So I brought in just a few examples of Sander to show you how extensive his site was as well as well as because as I've been working on critics I've been trying to think of who else is as successful a portrait test.

[00:37:29] That's one of the extraordinary accomplishments of Curtis's work is his ability to connect with his subject and Sandra comes close. But there aren't many. There really aren't from the entire from the origins of the history of photography in 1839 to the present day. There aren't many portraits who hit that same mark who managed to connect with so many different people. Now one of the main problems is that we don't know much about what Curtis knew or who he knew or what he was looking at.

[00:38:02] But the one thing we do know is that he made this extraordinary series of 20 luxury volumes beautifully produced of press with photo reviewer illustrations. And the precedent for that is camera work. They the luxury journal that Alfred Stieglitz produced with Edward's tycoon's help over and I should have written down the dates.

[00:38:35] I think it's 19 5 or 6 to 1913.

[00:38:42] I could be wrong but camera work was the place where all of the major pictorial lists who Alfred Stieglitz thought were worthy of attention got their work produced as beautiful photo reviewers and earlier Stieglitz had produced camera notes the volume for the camera club in New York City that also included beautiful photo graveyards that were a way of making it possible for multiple people multiple versions of the same photograph to be seen the way the photographer intended it to be seen.

[00:39:25] So that model has to be part of Curtis's thinking about his his production and so many of the pictorial list examples that I showed you were published in camera work and and because the entire run or virtually the entire run is in the Seattle Public Library. I'm assuming that Curtis would have access to it and that wouldn't be the only way published in camera work is the most famous portrait of J.P. Morgan by Edward strike. And it's a brilliant portrait that reveals so much about the state about Morgan's personality reveals great a great deal about style personality as well. And it's particularly famous for that visual pun where the hand grasping the chair rail looks like it's holding a knife I want to look a little closer at some of the portraits and I wanted to remind you that closeup portraits are particularly popular subjects for artists in the first quarter of the 20th century.

[00:40:34] Actually the first half of the 20th century earlier portraits did tend to be a fuller view of the figure although this like you see on the right that pyramid of the shoulders holding the head that becomes a device that you see all the way through the history of really the history of portraiture starting with 15th century paintings. These are just two members of the Seattle camera club. Well after Curtis had moved out of Seattle. But another way of understanding the photographic context of this period. So here are a couple examples of this really close up portrait type that Curtis used frequently throughout all of the volumes. A close up where virtually the entire body is is cut off as you see on the right.

[00:41:28] And it's it's almost just the head framed by the drapery that gives you really a frame within a frame to focus that intense gaze.

[00:41:42] So all of us are struggling with trying to figure out what is Curtis's relationship with his subject.

[00:41:49] We don't know and there's no way we can know but we can tell that there's a degree of connection there's a degree of sympathy in many of the interactions with his subjects that that's virtually impossible for most people to achieve.

[00:42:08] Taking pictures over and over again that suggests if nothing else he was an extraordinarily charming man but he managed to make his subjects feel that he was a sympathetic interlocutor that they had some degree of comfort in this relationship.

[00:42:28] I also wanted to get Francis Johnston in here somehow. She was if maybe Curtis's competition for Theodore Roosevelt's favorite photographer he she also took a lot of pictures of Roosevelt and his children a famous and beautiful photograph of Alice Roosevelt and was also an early professional lesbian photographer.

[00:42:54] I'm not sure how the chronology works out to Tim's point. It's her Gainsborough Girl which was one of her most famous photographs and one that a lot of pictorial list exhibitions included and frequently gave prizes to represents that kind of sentimental rising extreme. That's very very rare in her work in fact.

[00:43:17] And to go really far afield when you're talking about portraiture Rembrandt comes up and I think that there are things about Curtis's photographs of elder statesman among Indian peoples that suggests some familiarity with Rembrandt.

[00:43:37] Coburn That's another photographer who was in that Lewis and Clark exhibition and somebody who did extremely beautiful portraits not as successful as Curtis's but established the continued viability of this format for many decades and I want to spend a little bit of time taking advantage of some of these Santa types to look at variance and the difference between the proofs that Curtis chose not to follow and the images he ended up publishing in the North American Indian. So here we have red plume Pekin which is the frontispiece to that volume and the cyan type variant very very different strategy for depicting that subject.

[00:44:26] But I think a really beautiful photograph nonetheless here the distinction that he's chosen is pretty clear from that that kind of casual snapshot a mother and child to creating a very inward looking unit of mother and child in the final print here the detailing is different.

[00:44:49] He's he's asked him to add regalia and it also makes it utterly clear what a remarkable head this man has.

[00:45:00] What an incredible personality projects out of both images. This one I'm a little disappointed in his choice. I think that there's more of a kind of menace and also an internal contradiction between the the Western jacket and the other elements of the masquerade in the science type.

[00:45:23] And here it's remarkable what that shift in decision making does to your experience of the sculpture that he's he's photographed on the left you can see a human figure in the image and it media and that plus the architecture anchors the scale so much more precisely so that when you have the final plate you have no idea what it is you're experiencing but it is completely outside of the world in a way that the cyanide type prevents you from from experiencing at the same time.

[00:46:01] It's wonderful to see some of these process pieces because they catapults you back into the field.

[00:46:08] They give you some tiny glimpse of what it was like to be there and what what was seeming new what seemed possible what was impossible to wrap your mind around. They're arranged chronologically so it might be a little bit of a disappointment to look at the last two which are much more straightforward again.

[00:46:29] But here just he's chosen to get in closer and change his viewing angle slightly and my final image is one of sculpture where he decided to put two pieces in the frame instead of one as well as change the viewing angles. So having these Ciena types actually provides additional ethnographic information as well.

[00:46:55] I think looking at Curtis in this way allows us to remember that every single piece of this is a decision but that the decisions are framed by the period in which he lives and so many of the criticisms that are leveled at Curtis represent a 21st century viewpoint impossible to expect of somebody at the beginning of the 20th century. At the same time it's very easy to forget until you get the opportunity to hear Clay Tim talk about the work how much effort went into this and that it's not just zipping in with a camera taking a picture and jumping out again but I hope that just reminding you a little bit about the context about what other people around Curtis are doing. Allows him to come out again as an individual a thinker an actor somebody with hopes and dreams and aspirations and efforts whose work remains of a lasting interest to us today.

[00:48:11] Thank you.

[00:48:22] Applause and I zipped through that partly because there'd been the discussion of having a Q and A so I wanted to because I was throwing so much out at you I wanted to leave open that possibility if there were any specific questions to be able to address.

[00:48:39] Yeah okay yeah.

[00:48:42] So she's asking about photographic mediums and I mentioned quite a few of them. I don't know if you were here for Clay's talk over here on the platform you can see and view camera. The kind of camera that Curtis would have used in the field that would use glass plate negatives.

[00:49:06] When you print in the old days when you printed analog you would take that negative and you would cast light through it somehow or other and through a chemical reaction. Can you all hear wherever I you through a chemical reaction. Because of how the the surface is treated the negative of the negative. So a positive would be printed gelatin silver prints are were the standard way that black and white photographs were made until about ten years ago and those are suspending particles of silver oxide in a gelatin emulsion. That's on the surface of the paper that reacts to light and changes whether it's exposed to light or not and then is rinsed enough that the chemical reaction stops. Those are the that's the basic parameters in the 19th century. They didn't have silver gelatin they had a lot of other things but silver gelatin starts being fairly prevalent in the eighteen eighties so before Curtis's starting the order tone is made in a way like that but using glass rather than paper that's holding the emulsion.

[00:50:32] And then once you get the emotion down you can tone it in lots of different ways. Okay so he's using this thing that makes it look like gold basically cyan type is made with iron salts rather than silver salts and that's why. And then it turns blue. Remember blueprints in the old days. Those are Ciena type processes. OK. So it's an inexpensive medium it's one that's done with daylight. You don't need special lighting and that's one of the reasons why you could do it as proofing in the field. Platinum prints are made in a different way using platinum instead of silver gum by chrome 8 is made in a different way using a different kind of chemical that allows you to add pigments in layers and add a lot of manipulation. I think that's probably sufficient. Yeah

[00:51:27] Yeah.

[00:51:29] The question is is there a reason why so many of them references were German or is apparently German rather than say French and my answer would be no.

[00:51:45] I mean I could have used attache as another example of somebody around the turn of the century doing this kind of cataloguing extensively Stieglitz is of German origin striking is not striking was born in Luxembourg and case of beer I don't even remember where she might be German but no not necessarily. There it's all mixed together. It really is this the society in America. Some of the names that you mentioned are part of the photos obsession. The particular pictorial list group that Alfred Stieglitz created around himself.

[00:52:27] But he emphasized his particular notion of stringent quality pictorial ism.

[00:52:35] It's fascinating because it's really completely international movement.

[00:52:43] And by the 19 teens pictorial lists around the globe are sending photographs to each other for international exhibitions. So the Seattle Camera Club exhibition I did at the Henry included as a

case of Christmas cards that this members of the Seattle Camera Club had gotten from pictorial lists in Japan in Korea in Norway in Brazil. I mean it really is truly international.

[00:53:18] Thank you. Applause

[00:53:23] Applause Good afternoon. My name is Ann Ferguson. I'm the curator of the Seattle collection here at the Seattle Public Library. And as we begin our afternoon sessions I would like to again acknowledge that we are gathered together on the ancestral land of the Coast Salish people. We honor their elders past and present and thank them for the stewardship of this land. It is my great pleasure today to introduce our next speaker coal thrush Professor of History and affiliate and critical Indigenous Studies at the University of British Columbia in Vancouver. Cole is the author of native Seattle histories from the crossing overplays which examines the intersections between urban and indigenous history since Seattle first published in 2007 with the second edition. In 2017 the book won the Washington State Book Award for history and biography native Seattle has been widely praised as a transformative work of scholarship offering a new model for examining urban and indigenous histories together but those of you who have read native Seattle I'm sure you will agree with noted historian William Cronon who describes the book as a tour de force. Cole's latest book indigenous London native travelers at the heart of empire. Was published by Yale University Press in 2016 call is from the Seattle area and received his page D from the University of Washington. So we are delighted to have him back home and look forward to what I know will be a nuanced and insightful talk. Please join me in welcoming Cole thrush. Applause

[00:55:17] Thank you so much. And I wanted to start actually by Where's Jordan over there. Thank you Jordan for all your organizing of this. Applause

[00:55:28] And so I'd like to begin as has already been done today and as certainly is customary and in my corner of the profession I'd like to acknowledge particularly the Amish people some of whom are here for their stewardship of this land and their ongoing work in the space. I also wanted to acknowledge the must Graham first nation on whose traditional ancestral and unseated territory I live and work and I want to acknowledge them as well.

[00:55:52] So what I'd like to do today is change a little bit the direction maybe or flesh out the story a little bit in some other directions. I've really enjoyed the talks and Ivan what's changing my presentation as we were going through all their earlier talks. Nope nope she covered that I don't need to do that and so on. But what I really want to talk about today is is the world the Edward S. Curtis inhabited. And I think Clay had mentioned the baggage that he carries and that's mostly what I'm interested in today is the baggage and its big baggage its very big luggage.

[00:56:24] And so that's what I would like to talk about today. And I want to introduce two terms that may or may not be familiar to people in the room. One is settler colonialism which is the language we often use in Canada. I don't hear it as much in the United States. And then the word survivals which I'll explain in a little bit. So what I'd like to do is talk a little bit about the processes of settler colonialism and then get into some of the responses to that particularly from the Indigenous

colleagues and friends and activists and so on. So let me say a couple of May maybe lay out three truths about settler colonialism and I also want to run that justifiable untruth piece that we heard earlier. That's kind of what I'm talking about the myth of the vanishing race is an untruth. But I want to think about what it justified. That's what I'd like to talk about today so some facts of settler colonialism. First settler colonialism is a system that requires the attempted quote elimination of the native to build European societies on dispossessed indigenous lands.

[00:57:28] This is this is what settler colonialism is a second fact of it.

[00:57:34] It's a system in which we all live today not something that ended some time in the past. It's ongoing these processes that I'll be talking about today have ramifications that live into the present and we'll continue to live into the future and we are all inside it. This is something I really try to get across in my classes that even a student who just immigrated to Canada is part of the story. A student who is fifth generation Canadian is part of the story. My Indigenous students are obviously part of the story to that. If you think you're outside the story you're so inside that you can't even see it. That's one of the ways that that we talk about it and then the third and this is a really important point for me and I think it really speaks back to the kinds of language we saw from Curtis earlier today. That is it is an incomplete project settler colonialism didn't work in many ways and so I want us to really hold on to that idea as well. But we focused a lot today so far on the visual and so I wanted to start with some images of settler colonialism. This is one of my very favorite things to teach with American Progress front. You can hear my Canadian pronunciation now progress. John Gast 1872 this is an extremely popular image in its day and what it is is the spirit of progress drifting west across the plains and she's trailing telegraph wire behind her and she's holding a school book and around her you can see first of all Indigenous people kind of disappearing into the darkness that the left there and then around her all the stages of so-called civilization the wagon train the minor the plow the stagecoach the railroad and then in the light of the rising sun is the city and this is the way that North American history is typically told that Indigenous people are over here urbanity and cities are over here and never the twain shall meet when urban history begins indigenous history ends and so on.

[00:59:24] That's what I was trying to really wrestle with and undermine with native Seattle and also with my book about London. And so this is an image of manifest destiny and that's a term that I imagine most folks who know American history are familiar with. I just thought I'd throw up a quote from John O'Sullivan here who coined the term and add that phrase that claim is by the right of our manifest destiny to over spread and possess the whole of the continent which Providence God has given us for the development of the great experiment of liberty and Federated self-government entrusted to us. So settler colonialism is a spiritual and religious project in addition to a political one and a cultural one. And we see thousands of manifestations of it from O'Sullivan's time to later this is westward the course of empire takes its way which is also represented in massive form in Washington DC. I mean these are really standard images of the way Americans and I would say to somewhat of a lesser degree Canadians narrate their past.

[01:00:26] I mean this is the kind of world that Curtis inherited these sorts of ideas and that's where I want to take us today. So there's gas again. I was going to say something else that I've already said

other images from the same kind of framework from the 19th century. This is a page from a school book like the one the Spirit of Progress is carrying. And it says down at the bottom in American Indian contemplating the progress of civilization and what's really important for us if we're thinking visually about these images is the way that they're framed. So again to use that word and here the Indigenous person in this kind of stock character his bow is on strong his hatchet is laid down and he's kind of outside the frame. The real story is happening in the distance and he's not part of it. So he's outside of the future. He's trapped in the past. And here's an image from here 19 0 3 a real estate brochure the tied lands hadn't been filled yet of course but this is sort of stock characters from the American imagination that don't really have anything obviously to do with local Coast Salish culture and just sort of watching this belching industrial skyline of the future and so there again framed outside the story. And so what I am really interested in is how Curtis kind of inherited these ways of talking about indigenous people and modernity that those two things to be indigenous and to be modern are actually somehow mutually exclusive.

[01:01:52] He was. His work is legible because of that and one of the things I want us to be thinking about is why his work was so popular in its day and maybe is still popular in the present. What is it not so much what he's doing but what is his audience doing. What does his audience desire from these sorts of images. That's something I want us to be thinking about as well and I'll I'll mention I'll just show this image again which we've already talked about a bit. The two versions of the pig on large one with the clock inside it and I am of the mind that I think that this was a conscious decision maybe because Curtis was carrying some of these ideas about Indigenous city versus modernity but he certainly knew what his audiences wanted. And I think his audiences wanted something quote authentic. And so to have these markers of the modern in these images becomes a problem because the alternative to that another image like this that would have been quite contrary to Curtis's images is a photo like this from 1985. So this is guy Ashleigh or Geronimo the Apache leader and some other folks in a Cadillac. And this was a very common image very widely disseminated image in the early 20th century was a very popular image and it was an image that was designed I think to do a couple of things.

[01:03:15] One was to say look we've conquered this person and sort of tamed Grassley. This person who we had been so afraid of. But it also is a bit of a joke. It's that juxtaposition of the modern and the native that makes it kind of legible I guess. And so if you're interested in these images and these kinds of stories about Indigenous and modern things being so separate I really want to recommend the book Indians and unexpected places. It's an extremely well-written really and readable book by filled Gloria if you recognize that name. He's the son of vine Gloria who is kind of one of the great intellectual fathers of Indigenous Studies Native Studies a really important theologian. And Phil is now at Harvard but he's written this book that takes apart these kinds of images and shows people during the same time period of Curtis's life and native people making films and Hollywood native people doing sports and all these things that that don't client kind of track with our stereotypical images of Native people which are the images that Curtis was trafficking. So this is kind of almost an antique Curtis story in many ways I want to I'm going to leave a little time for questions today too but I wanted to do a little bit of a detour to a different place. I wanted to take us to Chicago in 1893 to the world's Columbian Exposition so as many of you know this was the great World's Fair in Chicago. Millions of

people went to it all the buildings or most of the buildings were built out of plaster which I think is quite interesting.

[01:04:51] It was a very temporary but sort of imposing space. It's the four hundredth anniversary of Columbus that it's celebrating and so on and it was really the United States Chicago but also the United States sort of saying we are now a world force we are a modern city we are a modern nation we are a force to be reckoned with. And there was an interesting event that took place at the Chicago fair the American Historical Association. So my profession met there and they heard the lecture from this guy Frederick Jackson Turner and he was fairly young scholar at the time younger than I am certainly. And he gave a talk called The significance of the frontier in American history and in that talk he really laid out a whole theory of American history that really crystallized a lot of ideas like John L. O'Sullivan's ideas like John guest's ideas and that American Progress painting and his basic thesis if I kind of simplify it is this that you take the sort of racial superiority of Europe you rub it up against savagery or civilization and out of that emerges this thing called the American and that is somehow superior and moving into the future and so on. And that was really his formulation and that is still really a powerful kind of image that Americans have almost always at least since the colonial period used that one of the ways that you assert your authority is by saying that you're Western or you're not from the frontier or so on Andrew Jackson who was before this.

[01:06:29] The president was one of the first presidents to really build a political career off of being a quote Indian fighter. And you can kind of see this language that the real Americans are on the frontier. That's a political language that is still with us today in many many ways. But what this does is it means his story of American history. You start with the fur trade and then you have some farms and then eventually you get towns and indigenous people kind of disappear from the story almost entirely. And what that means is that the markers or the symbols of indigenous people and of indigenous 80 in this way of thinking become kind of free floating they just kind of float around and are sort of now available because they aren't linked anymore to real people. And that's where you get things like this. So this is 1912 the golden pot latch. Keep in mind that the pot latch as has been said before was actually outlawed during this time period. But here are the city leaders the sort of chamber of commerce walking down the streets in Seattle dressed like totem poles. And so this is an example of if there are no real indigenous people left then these images are free for us to just use and to put to our own purposes this doesn't really actually tell us anything about Indigenous people at all.

[01:07:43] This is all about white people. This image and it brings us into the present it brings us into the mascot controversy it brings us into the Washington football team and its name its its offensive name that these are again images that just seem free floating because that's premised on the idea that the real indigenous people aren't here anymore because now we're in a modern society.

[01:08:09] And so there is this long standing idea that indigenous people simply are going to disappear. And I really feel like that's what made Curtis so powerful in his day. I'm not sure that that's why people look at him today so much but certainly during his lifetime that's why he was so compelling to so many people his images and so on were almost like an antidote to being modern. And that's that's something that I think it's really important for us to think about. But none of this was

inevitable and at the same time that all of these kinds of stories are being told and narratives are being produced there are real policies that are happening on the ground that are affecting Indigenous people. Most notably I mean when I when I'll talk about today. In addition to just flat out some folks called necro politics genocide is cultural genocide. And so the period that we're talking about the late 19th early 20th century is really the peak of at least in the United States the residential and boarding schools which were premised on the same idea that indigenous people can't possibly survive into the modern world unless they are changed. So Richard Henry Pratt who founded Carlyle you know his famous quote kill the Indian save the man. We have to remove all indigenous city from these children and then they can be part of our society. And this is a profoundly traumatic thing that is still ongoing for many Native people today. I'll just say in Canada the last residential school in Canada closed in nineteen ninety six.

[01:09:41] So this is very recent stuff there as well and one of the things that I think is ironic.

[01:09:48] I'm just I was thinking as I was putting this together that image of the clock in the lodge it really for me resonates with what was going on in the industrial school in the in the archives of the residential schools. You can see schedules like daily schedules and literally every five minutes there's something you had to be doing. The rebels being wrong and lines to stand in and all this. So this regimentation of time of these children's lives.

[01:10:16] I mean again it did happen in Canada too. And so what I would do or what I would add to the Curtis corpus the body of Curtis Curtis's work is another set of popular images during their day. And those are postcards of residential. So this is actually a postcard of the time Marwa school and your Salem Oregon. So this is something you could actually go and visit and you could buy this postcard and then send it to your friends. And I want us to think about the desire there the desire. Why would someone do this. Right. And this is another one from the Mohawk Institute and the text. A little too small to read but it's this is where the boys and girls go to school. And this is a really common kind of document that this was something desirable to go and see this work of civilization so-called being enacted upon these children.

[01:11:09] And we have to remember too in the 19th century it wasn't uncommon to for tourists to visit asylums and prisons and so on which are all similar kinds of institutions in many way so this all of this has real consequences for indigenous people including into the present and so I feel like one of my jobs as a non-Indigenous scholar is increasingly to get out of the way and to try to amplify what my Indigenous colleagues and so on are saying. And so I want to do a little bit of that as I move toward the latter part of this talk. So I want to you know amplify for example my hammock dashes words settler colonialism is an inherited silence where you know memories are supposed to be. And so there she is really speaking to cultural loss to the loss of identity the loss of language and so on. And the most important thing to remember I think always is that this is about land. This was always about land particularly in the British model of colonialism in North America and other places. It was about recreating British societies on someone else's land. But in the American context it's also not unconnected to other places. This is an image that my students and I do a lot of work with in my classes we spend an entire day unpacking this image. So this is Uncle Sam as a school teacher. And

it says so many things about race. At the end of the 19th century. So this is right around the turn of the century. And the children in the front Puerto Rico and Cuba younger children and darker children the older children in the back are the various states of the West. You can see a Chinese person stuck outside the school altogether looking in. There is an indigenous person sort of reading a school book but it's upside down. And then there's a black person washing the window.

[01:12:59] This is a super telling image it's really it's a robust image and it's an unapologetic image of American empire. And I think one of the things that I want us to think about when we think about settler colonialism is that it doesn't stop at the ocean and that American imperialism doesn't stop at the ocean it leap leapfrogged into other places as well and those legacies are still with us today. So I'm going to turn to the story of survival in just a minute but I wanted to just really quickly say something about a very real story that does speak to the issue of the so-called vanishing race. And that's that's what some scholars and others call ecological imperialism. And the best and most obvious example of those are the epidemics of this are the epidemics. So this is an early engraving of a scene that may or may not have really been seen by the artist I don't know. But when we think about 90 to 95 percent of the population of the Americas losing their lives in the first century of contact for many people that was evidence of the vanishing race that was evidence that that God was doing his work and you see this in early Puritan accounts in New England for example God is clearing the land for us and you'll often see in accounts of this stuff you'll see messages of sympathy. Oh it's very lamentable that this is happening but it's almost always followed by a statement of inevitability that this was just inevitable. And I think it's really important as we look at the historical archive and as we look at stories of Indigenous people struggling with this experience that sometimes people did. Indigenous people did wonder what's going to happen to us. And a good example of that SCAF or Seattle in his speech that's attributed to him there is a sense and this is what always I always struggle with this text. There's a sense that we're going to haunt the people who are coming but we may not be here ourselves anymore.

[01:15:00] And then I see this again and again in the archive and in oral traditions and so on where Indigenous people are concerned that in fact the vanishing race might be coming true because of what's going on with ecological imperialism with war and so on but I want to come out of that nosedive a little bit and tell a different kind of story.

[01:15:20] So this is my colleague Laura Ishiguro who works on British Columbia history and she has this really cogent statement the emerging settler order could be both powerful and personal inconsistent in its imposition complicated and its effects. We've been talking a lot about complexity and never inevitable or without resistance. And so this is really crucially important that we think about settler colonialism not as this done deal but something that's ongoing and the resistance is ongoing as well. And that's where I come to a term that I've found really useful in talking about these things with my students is the concept of survives. And it's a coin a term that was coined by Jerry visitor and Shanab a scholar. And he says that survivals is about more than just survival. It's kind of a combination word of survival and resistance. And it makes space not just for living through it all but things like creativity Joy rage other forms of resistance and so on and so I've I've found that in my work as a scholar and as a teacher it's really important that I when I talk about settler colonialism that

I also talk about surviving is that you have to have both those pieces one of that I would say one of the biggest challenges in writing history around imperialism and colonialism is if you overstate the power of colonialism then Indigenous people become only victims and they get past tensed. And then you get something a little bit like Curtis if you go too far in the other direction and only speak about survivors and only speak about Indigenous agency. Well then colonialism doesn't sound so bad.

[01:16:57] So that's not the right kind of story either. So for me what I try to do with my students is to help them learn to kind of oscillate in the space between those two versions of the story and to do it using historical evidence and to do it in solidarity with us today. That's kind of my goal as a teacher and this is a real theme I would say coming out in Indigenous Studies today is both an indictment of settler colonialism but also really clear expressions that Indigenous people have survived in the present and will survive into the future and are doing all kinds of creative things. My friend Audra Simpson who's probably one of the top two or three leading Indigenous intellectuals in the world right now. I just love the sentence the condition of indigenous city in North America is to have survived. That's exactly the opposite of some of the things that we've heard from Curtis and people from his time period it's it's quite a different story altogether and we can see this in you know the election of the last couple of weeks we've already mentioned at least briefly Reece Davidson Deb Holland and one of the things that I do want to say about Curtis and about the archive the colonial archive itself is that it can be used against itself. And Curtis is part of that. So I'm thinking back to nineteen ninety nine which is a long time ago now when I was in graduate school and the macaws started whaling again and the massive resistance they experienced particularly from the environmental movement.

[01:18:29] And one of the things that happened during that discussion was McColl people sort of reclaimed Curtis's image of images of whaling and said look this is an unbroken tradition. It's a tradition that was on hiatus for a while. It was on hold because the whales were mostly gone and we chose not to whale anymore. But now we're back. And so these images can be really useful for Indigenous communities and so in my criticisms of Curtis and what he thought he was doing and what his audiences thought they were consuming. It's really important to remember that Indigenous people have their own agendas with these images both at the time that they're being produced as well as today and these can be really important archives for communities for forgetting songs back for their vocabularies maybe for a language that is struggling to stay active and so on. And because I'm now a dual citizen I wanted to broadcast a little bit of Canadian material. This is a really good example of that process at work. Jeremy duchy just won the Polaris Prize in Canada which is sort of the biggest musical prize it's like the Grammys in Canada. He's while Istook or MLSE from New Brunswick and he has a whole album that he's created based on wax cylinder recordings that are 100 years old. So just like the kinds of things that Curtis was collecting he's built an entire album he's a classically trained musician he's built an entire album around these wax cylinder recordings where he's literally singing with them and remixing them. And it's I saw him live right after he won the Polaris. It was remarkable. It was one of the best concerts I've ever been to.

[01:20:03] So I really recommend you check him out because I want to sort of amplify his work. But it's really a good example of what I try to do in my teaching and I think what a lot of us in in Indigenous Studies are engaged in is trying to go back to these colonial archives and documents and

so on and put them to different uses. Can we read between the lines. Can we read against the grain. And I worked for Michael shoot for three years after my HD and that was one of the things they asked me to do. They said we don't care how racist the documents are or how wrong they are we just want to know where we're represented and then we'll figure out how to use those against themselves.

[01:20:42] So the colonial archive which sometimes gets ignored or dismissed can be a really powerful tool for resurgence and survivors and I've really appreciated two indigenous responses directly to Curtis and some of you may know the project 562 project that Machiko Wilbur from Tulalip has done which was sort of started as a response to Curtis. This is the Edward s Curtis project by Marie Clements is a matey woman from Canada from what is currently called Canada.

[01:21:15] And here she is. She's saying we have our own images we have our own voices we have our own ways of presenting ourselves and all of this work. Clement's work a Wilbur's work all of these projects of reclaiming and so on are part of resistance and they're part of resistance to the ongoing processes of settler colonialism that are happening today so we can see a through line a connection between what was happening in the 19th century and what's happening today and we can also think about these ongoing patterns of resistance like at Standing Rock. And so one of the things I'm quite interested in doing as a scholar and as a teacher and helping my students learn to do this is to try to find genealogies of resistance. That's what I how I phrase it. How can people who want to make change in the world today find their ancestors. And I don't necessarily mean literal ancestors but I mean kind of more figurative ancestors people who were doing the work before us. And so that's been really important to me so I'll end with a slide from Chicago in 1893 at the World's Fair World's Fairs often have included human zoos or what are often called human zoos. So ethnographic displays of people here in Seattle there were it and Filipino people put in on display on what's now the dub campus as part of the 1989 World's Fair and that was true in Chicago as well. And a group of quack quack quack people from British Columbia were brought to the fair and their images are the way they were portrayed really trafficked in images of savagery and cannibalism and all these sorts of horrible images but they were also there doing their own work.

[01:22:59] They were there for their own agenda as well again the pot latch and the ceremonial regalia and the dances and all that were outlawed. This was a way for them to put themselves on the world stage and see who they were and represent themselves and the power that's represented in their regalia and the masks and everything else and so on. So it's a chance for us to even in the most coercive exploitative kinds of moments to find agency to find resistance and that's something that I think is critically important for us. I still it's quite common. I would say for students to come into my courses or in other settings people will say you know they came in and destroyed native cultures and they'll often say that from a position of sympathy but it actually shuts down a story and it's not that different from what John Gast was saying or maybe Curtis and so on and so we have to really resist that narrative of the vanishing race because it's so powerful. It's just so powerful and it still is with us. And it's also if we think about the vanishing race then we also don't need to deal with it in the context or the consequences of colonialism. And so I guess that's what I would leave you with and I'll take some questions in a sec.

[01:24:16] I would leave you with again this idea that we are all inside the story whether we are do Hamish or Yakima or Norwegian or whatever we are. We are all here inside the story and I would like us all to learn how to take that seriously and learn how to do the good work that we have to do to try to undo some of the consequences of that history. So thanks

[01:24:50] We have some time I wanted to end early to make sure there was time for questions and then for moving between the different rooms so maybe eight or nine minutes if people have questions and please speak up because I have a little bit of hearing problem yeah. So the question has to do with our urbanity and one of the things that I tried to do in both native Seattle and indigenous London was show that it's not that these two histories indigenous and urban are mutually exclusive it's that they're actually mutually constitutive they actually create each other in conversation when those guys walk down the first Avenue address like totem poles they're actually saying indigenous it matters to us we're going to appropriate it and make it ourselves.

[01:25:27] But this is how we're going to sell our city as somehow modern by using these images. So it's really entangled and there are lots of examples of that in London as well. London kind of learns to be colonial in the 16th and 17th century because of indigenous people who either come or are brought to London in that period they show up in Shakespeare or they show up and Ben Johnson. So in London Londoners regularly when they see Indigenous visitors to the city who are often celebrities they use them as mirrors to talk about themselves and often about their own urban problems. So a really quick example in 17 10 for Mohawk leaders come to London to meet with Queen Anne and do diplomatic work and they're huge celebrities in the day and then they go home and two years later there's an outbreak of gang violence in Covent Garden. And the gang that is most feared and has plays written about it and so on it calls themselves the Mohawks. And so it's all these ideas about savagery and freedom and they're songs that were sung about them and so on that are all about kind of the idea of the noble savage doesn't have anything to do with indigenous people it has everything to do with life in the city. So it's a really good example of how entangled these things are. And in Seattle when I started my piece de work it just seemed really clear to me that these two histories are not separate here. You know the city is full of totem poles for better and for worse. You know there's all these images the city seal for example you just you can't make I mean the opening line of the book is every American city is built on Indian land. But few cities advertise it like Seattle

[01:27:01] This podcast was presented by the Seattle Public Library and Foundation and made possible by your contributions to the Seattle Public Library Foundation. Thanks for listening.